Public Expenditure Review and Evaluation of Child Protection in Odisha

Lekha Chakraborty
Amandeep Kaur
Jitesh Yadav
Balamuraly B

NIPFP

March 2023

CONTENTS

		Page No.
	List of Tables	iv
	List of Figures	v
	List of Boxes	vi
	Abbreviations	vii
	Executive Summary	ix
	Acknowledgements	xvi
Chapter 1		**1**
	Introduction	**1**
	1.1 Child Protection: The Analytical Framework	**2**
	1.2 Odisha: Fiscal Space and Budgeting for Child Protection	**4**
	1.3 The Objectives	**7**
	1.4 Data and Methodology	**7**
	1.5 Structure of the Report	**8**
Chapter 2	**Public Expenditure Review of Child Protection: Analyzing Aggregate Fiscal Space and Expenditure Prioritization**	**9**
	2.1 Aggregate Fiscal Space	**10**
	2.2 Allocating Resources to Strategic Priorities	**15**
	2.3 Child Protection Budgeting and Operational Efficiency	**25**
	2.4 Sector-specific Trends in Public Expenditure on Children in Odisha, 2017-18 to 2023-24	**33**
	2.5 Conclusion	**36**
Chapter 3	**Budget Credibility of Child Protection Spending in Odisha: Analyzing Fiscal Marksmanship and PEFA**	**38**
	3.1 Fiscal Marksmanship: A Survey	**39**
	3.2 Interpreting Data: Fiscal Marksmanship Ratios of Sectoral Child-centric spending	**39**
	3.3 Public Expenditure and Financial Accountability (PEFA) Score of Child-related Spending in Odisha	**43**
	3.4 Fiscal Marksmanship of Child Protection Schemes: The Selection Process	**45**
	3.5 Budget Forecasting Errors in Child Protection Schemes in Odisha	**47**
	3.6 Partitioning the Sources of Forecasting Errors of Child Protection Schemes in Odisha: Random Error or Bias?	**49**
	3.7 Conclusion	**51**
Chapter 4	**OECD Policy Evaluation of Child Protection Schemes in Odisha**	**52**
	4.1 OECD Evaluation: The Analytical Framework	**53**
	4.2 Approach and Methodology	**55**

	4.3 OECD DAC Evaluation: Adapting the criteria through matrices	**56**
	4.4 Analysing Child Protection Schemes using OECD DAC Criteria	**60**
	4.5 The Theory of Change: Outcome and Impact Matrices for each policy intervention	**72**
	4.6 Utilisation Ratio of Child Protection Schemes in Odisha	**93**
	4.7 SDG Framework and Child Protection Interventions in Odisha	**95**
	4.8 Conclusion	**97**
Chapter 5	**Public Financial Management and Children Protection Outcomes: A Quantitative Evaluation**	**99**
	5.1 Determinants of Child Protection Outcomes: A Survey	**100**
	5.2 Child Protection Outcomes: Interpreting the Data 5.3 Quantitative Evaluation: The results from panel models 5.4 Conclusion	**101** **106** **108**
Chapter 6	**Public Expenditure Tracking, Institutional Review of CCIs and Accountability: District level Inferences**	**110**
	6.1 Aggregation of Districts based on Migration, Conflict, Mining and Disaster	**111**
	6.2 Inadequate Planning for identification of "Vulnerable Children": District wise Analysis	**111**
	6.3 District wise Diagnosis and Covid 19 Pandemic Specific Programmes on Child Protection	**115**
	6.4: Vulnerable Children: Institutionalization	**123**
	6.5: Database, Need-based research on Child Protection and Dissemination	**127**
	6.6: Analyzing the Funding Pattern across Child Care Institutions	**128**
	6.7: District wise Analysis of Unutilized Funds for CCI Infrastructure	**130**
	6.8: Children in Conflict with Law and Institutions under Juvenile Justice Board	**131**
	6.9: Unutilised Funds: Non-Implementation of Innovative Projects for Child Protection	**131**
	6.10: **Expenditure Tracking: District level Case Studies**	**132**
	6.11: **Child Protection: Outcome-based Budgeting**	**139**
	6.12 Conclusions	**141**
Chapter 7	**Conclusion**	**141**
	References	**156**
	Annexure A1: Technical Glossary A2: UNIFEM Child Protection Strategic Framework for Fiscal Mapping	**168**

Acknowledgements

We express our gratitude to Pinaki Chakraborty, former Director, NIPFP, for commissioning this study at NIPFP and for his valuable comments and suggestions during NIPFP-UNICEF Inception-Interim Report meetings held at NIPFP.

Special thanks are due to Kavita Rao, the current Director of NIPFP, for her guidance and the enabling environment at NIPFP for the completion of this study.

We express our gratitude to Hyun Hee Ban, Chief of Social Policy, Monitoring, and Evaluation, UNICEF India, for providing her valuable support and vision for conducting the study.

Also, thanks are due to Soumen Bagchi, social policy specialist at UNICEF, for his insightful comments on the Inception Report and Interim Report. The comments by him and Pinaki Chakraborty related to conducting a "quantitative evaluation" were well taken. Using panel data, this quantitative analysis is included in this study, which was also released in the Working Paper series of the Levy Economics Institute of Bard College, New York. Thanks are due to anonymous reviewers at the Levy Economics Institute, New York. This econometric analysis was also presented at the national level Econometric Society conference in January 2023, and we sincerely acknowledge the comments from the scholars who attended.

Thanks are due to Maaike Bijker, Chief of Evidence (Data Research and Evaluation), UNICEF, India, and Soumen Ray of UNICEF Odisha for their valuable comments and suggestions during the Inception Report presentation at NIPFP.

We sincerely acknowledge the valuable support from Ajay Singh, SPSP Specialist, UNICEF, and Odisha for the project's completion, incorporating field-level inferences.

Thanks are due to Sugato Roy for his valuable support for the project and financial guidance.

Special thanks are due to Ms. Shubha Sarma, Commissioner-Cum-Secretary, for her valuable comments on the interim report presented at the State Secretariat, Odisha.

We are grateful to the Department of Finance, Government of Odisha, for their kind support for the study. A special word of thanks to Satya Priya Rath, Additional Secretary (Budget), Department of Finance, Odisha, and his team for sharing the valuable time series data related to child protection spending in Odisha. We acknowledge the valuable discussions with Sreeraj Ashok, Deputy Accountant General, Odisha.

We express our thanks to Atishay Mathur, Research and Evaluation Specialist, UNICEF, New Delhi, and Swati Saluja, Evaluation Consultant, for their valuable feedback on OECD evaluation methodology and also for sharing evaluation matrices as well as internal materials and documents from UNICEF. A separate list of these internal documents shared by UNICEF for our study is included in the references.

Also, thanks are due to Van Chi Pham, former Child Protection Specialist at UNICEF Country Office; Padmanav Dutta, Monitoring and Evaluation (Child Protection) Specialist; and Neha Naidu, Child Protection Specialist in UNICEF, Odisha, for their insightful comments in the meeting at UNICEF New Delhi Office. As an outcome of the meeting, we have incorporated a separate chapter, as suggested, in the final report on "fiscal management of child protection schemes in Odisha".

A special word of thanks to Kaushik Bhadra of UNICEF, New Delhi, for his valuable comments on the interim report.

We express our thanks to Subrat Das, Executive Director, Centre for Budget and Governance Accountability (CBGA), for the constructive meeting on child protection co-organised by NIPFP and CBGA. We benefited immensely from the presentation by Provita Kundu, thematic lead for social sectors at CBGA, and the materials provided by CBGA. We extend our thanks to Nilachala Acharya, Research Lead and Thematic Lead for Fiscal Transparency; Revati, Shuchita Rawal, Senior Programme Officer; Vijayta Mahendru, Policy Analyst; and other scholars who attended the NIPFP-CBGA meeting.

We sincerely acknowledge the discussions with Enakshi Ganguly, child rights activist and co-founder of HAQ. A special thanks to HAQ for sharing the informative publications on child protection.

We acknowledge the discussions on public expenditure reviews with George Joseph of the World Bank. Thanks are due to Rajiv Nandi of the UN Evaluation Group for his insightful comments. We have gained valuable insights from reaching out to the Independent Evaluation Group of the World Bank.

Thanks are due to Ratnesh, the former programme manager at NIPFP, for his comments and suggestions.

Special thanks are due to Mr. Pankaj Sinha, Chief Administrative Officer, NIPFP, for his procedural and financial guidance, and to Mr. Birender Rawat, NIPFP Accounts Officer, for his finance and accounting support. Thanks are due to Mr. Manish Mishra for financial procedures and providing clarity in financial management.

We express our thanks to H. K. Amarnath, Head of the NIPFP Database, for providing the finance accounts and other budget-related data required for the study. Thanks are also due to Rohit Dutta for his support in data analytics. Special thanks are due to Divy Rangan for his timely support for data analytics.

We also acknowledge the support received from Roby Thomas of NIPFP for the IT-related infrastructure and the support received from Kavita Issar and Amita Manhas for their able secretarial and editorial assistance.

The findings in this report are those of the authors and not those of NIPFP.

Lekha Chakraborty
Amandeep Kaur
Jitesh Yadav
Balamuraly B